



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_6615
Title of the Manuscript:	Sugarcane Genotype Performance in Three Environments (Based on Crop Cycle) at Mardan, Pakistan
Type of the Article	Research Paper

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Location and time considered as sources of variation in the discussion had created confusion. There is no interaction assessment as in usually G x E study. The study seems to be a single location effect on some cultivars which identification was priority required. The main problematic aspect of the study was not exposed enough! There is also a poor discussion of results, deepening the confusion.	- The said narration G x L has been removed. - The genotypes were grown under 2 plant crops and one ratoon crop environments. - An application of Shukla's stability variance (when GxE is significant) is stated. - However, further improvement in discussion part would be welcomed.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	I miss the unit of studied parameters.	- Units have been inserted in the tables.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	The study can make sense if considered as assessment of the performance of some new sugarcane cultivars at Mardan, Pakistan. But, we'll still need to know why this study is required?	- The title of the paper includes the assessment as well refer to the crop cycles (two plants and one ratoon crops)/environments. - Objective of the study was to identify the effect of different environments (crop cycles) on the performance of sugarcane genotypes as well as find stable genotypes across these environments. - The results of the present study could



SDI Review Form 1.6

		certainly will be valuable in improvement of the breeding program at SCRI, Mardan.
--	--	--